

27th Meeting of Harbourfront Commission
held at 3:00 pm on 8 May 2017 at the Conference Room,
15/F, North Point Government Offices, 333 Java Road, Hong Kong

Minutes of Meeting

Present

Mr Nicholas BROOKE	Chair
Mr Eric MA	Secretary for Development, Vice Chair
Mrs Margaret BROOKE	Representing Business Environment Council
Mr LEUNG Kong-yui	Representing Chartered Institute of Logistics and Transport in Hong Kong
Mr Ken SO	Representing Conservancy Association
Mrs Karen BARRETTO	Representing Friends of the Earth
Mr Freddie HAI	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Architects
Mr Evans IU	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Landscape Architects
Dr Peter Cookson SMITH	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Planners
Sr Emily LI	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors
Mr Ivan HO	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Urban Design
Ir Prof CHOY Kin-kuen	Representing Hong Kong Institution of Engineers
Mr Louis LOONG	Representing Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong
Mr Winston CHU	Representing Society for Protection of the Harbour
Mr CHAN Ka-kui	
Mr Walter CHAN	
Ms Kelly CHAN	
Mr Hans Joachim ISLER	
Mr Alan LO	
Mr Vincent NG	
Mr Frankie NGAN	
Mr Michael WONG	Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands), Development Bureau (DEVB)
Mr Edward LEUNG	Senior Manager (Tourism)21, Tourism Commission (TC)
Mr Simon LAU	Chief Traffic Engineer/Kowloon, Transport Department (TD)

Ms Alice PANG	Project Manager (Kowloon), Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD)
Mrs Doris FOK	Assistant Director (Leisure Services)1, Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD)
Mr CHEUK Fan-lun	Assistant Director/Planning & Services, Marine Department (MD)
Mr Raymond LEE	Director of Planning
Miss Christine AU	Secretary

In Attendance

Mr Thomas CHAN	Deputy Secretary (Planning and Lands)1, DEVB
Mr Allen FUNG	Political Assistant to Secretary for Development, DEVB
Ms Taryi HA	Senior Information Officer (Development)3, DEVB
Mr Larry CHU	Assistant Secretary (Harbour)1, DEVB
Ms Jenny WONG	Assistant Secretary (Harbour) Special Duties, DEVB
Miss Emily SOM	Assistant Secretary (Harbour) 2, DEVB
Mr Peter MOK	Project Manager (Harbour), DEVB

Absent with Apologies

Ms Vivian LEE
Mr KAN Chak-fun

For Agenda Item 3

Mr KWOK Yam-yung	Commandant of Police Tactical Unit, Hong Kong Police Force (Police)
Mr Ricky HO	Deputy District Commander, Yau Tsim District, Police
Ms TSE Tsui-yan	Divisional Commander, Wan Chai Division, Police
Ms Natalie HONG	Chief Inspector (Operations), Event Planning Team, Operations Wing, Police

Action

Welcoming Message

Action

The Chair welcomed all to the meeting. He informed Members that the Society for Protection of the Harbour had nominated Mr Winston CHU to be their representative to the Commission on 8 February 2017 and the Business Environment Council had nominated Mr Andy LEWIS to be their alternate representative to the Commission on 24 April 2017. He welcomed Mr Winston CHU for attending the meeting.

He also informed Members that Mr Edward LEUNG, Senior Manager of TC, was attending on behalf of Ms Cathy CHU; Mr Simon LAU, Chief Traffic Engineer of TD, was attending on behalf of Mrs Ingrid YEUNG; Ms Alice PANG, Project Manager of CEDD, was attending on behalf of Mr LAM Sai-hung; Mrs Doris FOK, Assistant Director of LCSD, was attending on behalf of Ms Michelle LI; and Mr CHEUK Fan-lun, Assistant Director of MD, was attending on behalf of Ms Maisie CHENG.

The Chair said that he considered it an appropriate timing to review the work of the Commission in the last seven years since its establishment and deliberate further on the best way forward. He suggested the discussion to take place as a closed-door session at the next Commission meeting.

Mr Vincent NG agreed with the Chair's suggestion. **Mr LEUNG Kong-yui** suggested the Commission to discuss the initiatives to be funded by the \$500 million funding earmarked for harbourfront enhancement.

Item 1 Confirmation of Minutes of the 25th and 26th Meetings

- 1.1 **The Chair** said that the Secretariat circulated the draft minutes of the 25th meeting to Members on 24 April 2017 and the revised draft minutes were circulated on 2 May 2017. The Secretariat also circulated the draft minutes of the 26th meeting to Members on 2 May 2017. There being no other proposed amendments, the minutes of the 25th and 26th meetings were confirmed at the meeting.

Item 2 Matters Arising

A. Hong Kong 2030+: Towards a Planning Vision and Strategy Transcending 2030 (paragraph 3.16 of the minutes of the 25th meeting)

2.1 **The Chair** said the public engagement exercise for the “Hong Kong 2030+: Towards a Planning Vision and Strategy Transcending 2030” was concluded on 30 April 2017. The Planning Department is consolidating comments received and would brief the Commission on the progress of refining its planning vision and strategy in due course.

B. Review Study for Kai Tak Development (paragraph 4.31 of the minutes of the 25th meeting)

2.2 **The Chair** informed the meeting that the Commission’s views on the proposed amendments to the outline zoning plan in relation to the review study for Kai Tak Development were conveyed to the Town Planning Board on 20 January 2017. A plan showing pedestrian circulation and connectivity to the proposed landscaped deck at the former runway was circulated to Members for information on 24 April 2017.

C. Setting Up of a Working Group on the Protection of the Harbour Ordinance (paragraph 6.2 of the minutes of the 25th meeting)

2.3 **The Chair** said that the first meeting of the Working Group on the Protection of the Harbour Ordinance (WGPHO) was held on 24 February 2017 and he would report the discussion of the meeting under agenda item 8 of the meeting.

D. Harbourfront Initiatives to be Funded by the \$500 million Dedicated Funding (paragraph 1.18 of the minutes of the 26th meeting)

2.4 **Miss Christine AU** informed Members that the Harbour Unit

Action

had proposed six initiatives to be funded by the \$500 million that was earmarked for harbourfront enhancement at the last meeting on 23 January 2017. Further details of the initiatives were also presented at subsequent meetings of the three geographic Task Forces. A workshop was also organised on 18 April 2017 for Commission and Task Force Members to discuss proposed initiatives and other ideas. She briefed Members on the views received with the aid of a PowerPoint.

- 2.5 On the initiative to enhance streetscape and wayfinding along the harbourfront, **the Chair** commented that diversified means such as mobile application should be considered. Separately, he asked the Harbour Unit to engage the Commission closely when implementing these initiatives.
- 2.6 **Mr Vincent NG** supported to fund the six initiatives proposed. He opined that to gain community support of the initiatives, it should be highlighted that the two public works projects proposed for Hong Kong Island could significantly extend the waterfront promenade and help realise the Commission's vision of providing a continuous and accessible harbourfront.
- 2.7 **Mr Freddie HAI** said that the allowed sum of HK\$500M was not much from project perspective. The initiatives should therefore focus on enhancing overall accessibility to the harbourfront but not the minor improvement works to beautify specific harbourfront areas with additional railing and landscaping, which should be left to the local District Councils to carry out at their own pace. The HC projects should aim to open up waterfront promenades for public access which should be completed as early as possible and the completed waterfront promenades could be used for testing the enhanced management rules which would allow more shared uses with a view to applying to the entire harbourfront in the long run. Based on this logic, he opined that the open space project at Sai Ying Pun should be accorded higher priority over the urban park in Hung Hom.
- 2.8 **Mr Winston CHU** echoed with the views of Mr Vincent NG and

Action

Mr Freddie HAI and commented that the Commission should strive to fulfil its vision of constructing a continuous waterfront promenade along both sides of Victoria Harbour. He opined that it would be easier to realise the vision on the Hong Kong Island side first and a target timeframe should be set. He added that the Government and the community should recognise the existing shoreline as the limit for reclamation. There should be a strategic plan for developing the harbourfront areas as a whole before considering any piecemeal reclamation proposals individually.

- 2.9 To achieve the Commission's vision of creating an attractive and vibrant harbourfront, **Dr Peter Cookson SMITH** opined that the Commission should be closely engaged when implementing the initiatives to ensure that the future waterfront promenades and open space would not become conventional urban parks.
- 2.10 **Miss Christine AU** provided Members an overview of other harbourfront developments and projects that would be taken forward in parallel along the harbourfront areas. She added that the Government had been actively taking forward various harbourfront enhancement initiatives in the past years and could report the overall progress at the next Commission meeting.
- 2.11 **The Chair** expressed his support to the six initiatives proposed and urged the Government to take into account Members' comments and engage the Commission closely when taking forward these initiatives.

Item 3 Crowd Management of Events at the Harbourfront Areas

- 3.1 **The Chair** welcomed representatives of the Police to the meeting. Mr Ricky HO briefed Members on the principles of crowd management adopted by the Police using Yau Tsim Mong district as an example.

Action

- 3.2 **The Chair** enquired if there would be any contingency plan prepared for undesirable weathers, the impact of closing the Avenue of Stars, and whether different measures would be applied for events held in daytime and in the evening.
- 3.3 **Mr Walter CHAN** enquired whether fire engine on the land side or fire boat from the sea side would be more effective in putting out fires breaking out on the harbourfront.
- 3.4 **Mr Winston CHU** said that the Society for Protection of the Harbour (SPH) had organised six harbour day celebrations in the past ten years, some of which involved a walk along the harbourfront on the northern Hong Kong Island. This year, SPH was exploring to organise another walk from the Star Ferry Pier to the Golden Bauhinia Square through the new Central harbourfront where reclamation had been completed. He enquired if it would be permissible by the Police.
- 3.5 **Mr Freddie HAI** enquired about number of cases involving people falling into the waters accidentally during events in the past ten years.
- 3.6 **Prof CHOY Kin-ken** enquired if the Police would adopt different sets of crowd density ratios under different situations.
- 3.7 **Mr KWOK Yam-yung** made the following responses-
- (a) the Police would flexibly apply the crowd management principles and crowd density ratio was not the only benchmark. The Police would take into account other factors such as nature of events and psychological condition and dynamics of patrons when making comprehensive assessment;
 - (b) we do not have information at hand regarding people accidentally falling into the waters along the harbourfront under the influence of alcohol during police operations,

Action

but there had been cases of people falling into the sea under the influence of alcohol. The contingency plan had included such scenario for onsite police officers to prevent such accidents from happening during events; and

- (c) the Police would consider SPH's application and facilitate the event as appropriate.

3.8 **Ms TSE Tsui-yan** briefed Members on crowd management measures adopted for the Wan Chai waterfront with the aid of a PowerPoint. In response to the Chair's enquiry, she said each event organiser would be required to work out contingency plans under different extreme weather conditions such as rainstorm or tropical cyclone and decide whether the event would be cancelled. The Police would liaise with the organiser and assist the execution of these contingency measures as appropriate.

3.9 As many popular large-scale events such as the Symphony under the Star, the Hong Kong Wine and Dine Festival and several concerts were held at the new Central harbourfront, **the Chair** enquired if the Police had faced any particular challenges on this part of the harbourfront.

3.10 Taking the Symphony under the Star as an example, **Ms TSE Tsui-yan** responded that the event was not held at the waterfront and the event organiser had developed a crowd management plan. The Police assisted the organiser in executing the crowd management plan and provided other necessary support such as making special traffic arrangement to divert pedestrian and vehicle flow to facilitate the smooth operation of the event. She opined that the events at the new Central harbourfront would not pose any specific challenge to the Police.

3.11 **Mr Ricky HO** supplemented the following -

- (a) the Police would reserve and mobilise additional

Action

manpower to deal with unexpected situations. They would also communicate with other departments in particular the Fire Services Department to devise contingency plans before the occurrence of events. Additional laagering points would also be reserved for emergency vehicles;

- (b) the closure of Avenue of Stars in Tsim Sha Tsui would not affect crowd control arrangement for the Tsim Sha Tsui area. The site occupied only a small portion of the entire harbourfront area from Tsim Sha Tsui to Hung Hom, and could usually accommodate around 3 000 patrons, as compared to around 300 000 patrons in other harbourfront areas;
- (c) under undesirable weather conditions, outdoor events could be cancelled, or the number of patrons was likely to decrease. It should not create specific difficulty for the Police to implement measures in relation to crowd management;
- (d) for celebratory fireworks, fireboats would be deployed along the shoreline; and
- (e) as far as he could recall, there was no case involving spectator falling into the waters during celebratory fireworks in the past few years. The Police had put in place preventive measure to restrict the public from getting too close to the waterfront by reserving a 1m wide emergency passageway at the waterfront with mills barriers.

3.12 **Mr Ivan HO** asked whether the design of the existing harbourfront promenades would hamper the effectiveness of executing crowd control measures, and if provision of certain facilities, such as first-aid posts and public toilets in the existing or future promenades, could help the Police carry out their duties more effectively.

Action

- 3.13 **Mr LEUNG Kong-yui** concurred with Mr Ivan Ho that the promenade design should facilitate crowd management.
- 3.14 **Mr CHAN Ka-kui** enquired if the design of waterfront promenades under development would be circulated to the Police for comments.
- 3.15 **Mr KWOK Yam-yung** responded that from crowd management perspective, the Police would prefer patrons to be scattered along the promenade instead of concentrating at certain attractions. Attractions which might attract a large number of patrons should be spread out. Quoting a recent accident in Shanghai as an example, he said that for a small area that gathered a large number of patrons, even staircases could pose threat to public safety. In terms of promenade design, the Police would need provision of emergency lighting system that could be activated swiftly. Built-in Public Address System and clear signage would also help the Police when carrying out operations. He added that the Police would be happy to provide comments on proposed design of promenades. To address an earlier query on contingencies, he assured the meeting that the majority of police's planning effort for such major operations is in fact preparation for various contingencies.
- 3.16 **Mr Winston CHU** opined that it would help the work of the Police if there was a command post set up at the new Central harbourfront to handle possible emergency situations.
- 3.17 **The Chair** thanked the Police for their presentation.

Item 4 Progress Report from Task Force on Harbourfront Developments on Hong Kong Island (Paper No. HC/02/2017)

- 4.1 **The Chair**, in his capacity as the Chair of the Task Force, took Members through the progress report.

Action

- 4.2 **Dr Peter Cookson SMITH** enquired about the latest progress of developing Site 3 on the new Central harbourfront.
- 4.3 **Miss Christine AU** responded that the revised planning brief which had taken into account comments from Members was endorsed by the Town Planning Board on 23 December 2016. The endorsed planning brief would be circulated to Members for information.

[Post-meeting notes: The Metro Planning Committee (MPC) Paper No. 19/16 and the endorsed planning brief for Site 3 development on the new Central harbourfront were circulated to Members for information on 29 May 2017. The Secretariat also made a report about the development of Site 3 under "Any Other Business" of the Task Force meeting on 29 May 2017.]

Item 5 Progress Report from Task Force on Kai Tak Harbourfront Development (Paper No. HC/03/2017)

- 5.1 **Mr Vincent NG**, the Chair of the Task Force, briefed Members on the progress report.

Item 6 Progress Report from Task Force on Harbourfront Developments in Kowloon, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing (Paper No. HC/04/2017)

- 6.1 **The Chair**, on behalf of the Chair of the Task Force who was in absentia, presented the progress report.

Item 7 Progress Report from Task Force on Water-land Interface (Paper No. HC/05/2017)

- 7.1 **Mr LEUNG Kong-yui**, the Chair of the Task Force, briefed Members on the progress report.

Action

Item 8 Progress Report from Working Group on the Protection of the Harbour Ordinance (Paper No. HC/06/2017)

- 8.1 **The Chair**, in his capacity as the Chair of the Working Group, took Members through the progress report.
- 8.2 In response to the Chair's enquiry, **Miss Christine AU** said that the next Working Group meeting would be scheduled for mid-May. Members would be briefed on the definition of "reclamation", "forming land" as well as "overriding public need", amongst others.

Item 9 Any Other Business

- 9.1 **Mrs Karen BARRETTO** suggested Members to be briefed on the latest developments at the working part of the harbour including the container terminals.
- 9.2 **The Chair** requested the Secretariat to arrange a briefing at a future meeting.
- 9.3 **Mr Alan LO** enquired if the Commission would revisit the proposal to establish a statutory Harbourfront Authority under the new Administration after 1 July 2017.
- 9.4 **The Chair** said the final report on the proposed establishment of a Harbourfront Authority would be passed to the new Administration for consideration. He said that he would invite Members' views on this subject at the next meeting.
- 9.5 There being on other business, the meeting ended at 5:00 pm.

**the
Secretariat**