

22nd Meeting of Harbourfront Commission
held at 3:00 pm on 21 December 2015 at the Conference Room
on Upper Ground Floor, Hong Kong Heritage Discovery Centre,
Kowloon Park, Haiphong Road, Tsim Sha Tsui, Kowloon, Hong Kong

Minutes of Meeting

Present

Mr Nicholas BROOKE	Chair
Mr Paul CHAN	Secretary for Development, Vice-Chair
Mrs Margaret BROOKE	Representing Business Environment Council
Prof Becky LOO	Representing Chartered Institute of Logistics and Transport in Hong Kong
Dr NG Cho-nam	Representing Conservancy Association
Mrs Karen BARRETTO	Representing Friends of the Earth
Dr Peter Cookson SMITH	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Planners
Sr Emily LI	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors
Mr Ivan HO	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Urban Design
Mr Louis LOONG	Representing Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong
Mr Hardy LOK	Representing Society for Protection of the Harbour
Mr CHAN Hok-fung	
Mr Walter CHAN	
Mr KAN Chak-fun	
Mr Vincent NG	
Mr Michael WONG	Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)
Mr Daniel CHUNG	Director of Civil Engineering and Development (CEDD)
Ms Emily MO	Assistant Commissioner for Tourism 2, Tourism Commission (TC)
Mr TANG Wai-leung	Assistant Commissioner/Urban, Transport Department (TD)
Mrs Doris FOK	Assistant Director (Leisure Services)1, Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD)
Mr CHEUK Fan-lun	Assistant Director/Planning & Services (Atg.), Marine Department (MD)

Ms Amy CHEUNG	Assistant Director of Planning/Territorial, Planning Department (PlanD)
Miss Christine AU	Secretary

In Attendance

Mr Eric MA	Under Secretary for Development
Mr Allen FUNG	Political Assistant to Secretary for Development
Miss Fannie KONG	Press Secretary to Secretary for Development
Mr Larry CHU	Assistant Secretary (Harbour) 1, Development Bureau (DEVB)
Mr Frederick YU	Assistant Secretary (Harbour) Special Duties, DEVB
Miss Ingrid TJENDRO	Assistant Secretary (Harbour) 2, DEVB
Mr Peter MOK	Project Manager (Harbour), DEVB
Mr LEUNG Kong-yui	Chair, Task Force on Water-land Interface

Absent with Apologies

Mr Franklin YU	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Architects
Mr Evans IU	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Landscape Architects
Ir Prof CHOY Kin-kuen	Representing Hong Kong Institution of Engineers
Mr CHAN Ka-kui	
Ms Lily CHOW	
Mr Eric FOK	
Mr Hans Joachim ISLER	
Ms Vivian LEE	

Welcoming Message

The Chair welcomed all to the 22nd meeting of the Harbourfront Commission. He informed Members that Ms Emily MO, Assistant Commissioner of TC, was attending on behalf of Ms Cathy CHU; Mr TANG Wai-leung, Assistant Commissioner of TD, was attending on behalf of Mrs Ingrid YEUNG; Mrs Doris FOK, Assistant Director of LCSD, was attending on behalf of Ms Michelle LI; Mr CHEUK Fan-lun, Assistant Director of MD, was attending on behalf of Ms Maisie CHENG; and Ms Amy CHEUNG, Assistant Director of PlanD, was attending on behalf of Mr LING Kar-kan.

Item 1 Confirmation of Minutes of the 21st Meeting

1.1 **The Chair** said that the Secretariat circulated the draft minutes of the last meeting to Members on 1 December 2015, and received no comments from Members. There being no proposed amendment, the draft minutes were confirmed at the meeting.

Item 2 Matters Arising

A. *Land Use Review on the Western Part of Kennedy Town*
(Paragraph 2.2 of the minutes of the 21st meeting)

2.1 **The Chair** informed the meeting that PlanD had consulted Members on the conceptual design of the waterfront areas at the meeting of the Task Force on Harbourfront Developments on Hong Kong Island on 24 November 2015. He said as the Task Force Chair, he would report the discussion under Item 4 of this meeting.

B. *Future Development of the New Central Harbourfront (Paragraph 4.1 of the minutes of the 21st meeting)*

2.2 **The Chair** said that the Harbour Unit briefed the Task Force on Harbourfront Developments on Hong Kong Island on the permanent and temporary uses of the new Central harbourfront sites at its meeting on 24 November 2015. He said as the Task Force Chair, he would report the discussion under Item 4 of this meeting. Separately, he requested the Secretariat to arrange a briefing for Members on the proposed Food Truck Pilot Scheme.

the Secretariat

(Post-meeting note: The briefing was held on 20 January 2016.)

C. *Circulation of the updated Harbour Plan (Paragraph 4.5 of the minutes of the 21st meeting)*

2.3 **The Chair** said that with reference to the feedback received from Members, the Harbour Plan was further refined, and the Secretariat circulated the plan to Members on 1 December 2015. He recapped that there were four areas proposed to have potential for hosting water-related activities.

D. *Water Quality in Kwun Tong Typhoon Shelter (KTTS) and Kai Tak Approach Channel (KTAC) (Paragraph 5.9 of the minutes of the 21st meeting)*

2.4 **The Chair** said that at the 19th meeting of the Task Force on Kai Tak Harbourfront Development held on 18 November 2015, CEDD informed Members that they had already embarked upon another study to identify further feasible measures to improve the water quality at KTAC/KTTS for accommodating other possible beneficial uses including water sports activities. It was expected that preliminary findings would be available in mid-2016 and CEDD would report to the Task Force on the recommendations again.

E. *Flood-prone Areas, Unlicensed Vessels and*

Management of Seawalls and Other Marine Infrastructures (Paragraph 6.3 of the minutes of the 21st meeting)

2.5 **The Chair** said that the two matters would be followed up at the upcoming meetings of the Task Force on Water-Land Interface.

Item 3 Progress Report from Task Force on Harbourfront Developments on Hong Kong Island (Paper No. HC/17/2015)

3.1 **The Chair**, in his capacity as the Chair of the Task Force, briefed Members on the progress report.

3.2 **Dr Peter Cookson SMITH** expressed concern over the removal of trees in the Cadogan Street Temporary Garden due to decontamination works. He suggested inviting the responsible government department to discuss the issue with Members.

3.3 **Miss Christine AU** said that CEDD had provided a paper setting out details of the ground decontamination works at the site of ex-Kennedy Town Incineration Plant/Abattoir, which was circulated to Members of the Task Force on Harbourfront Developments on Hong Kong Island earlier. She said the paper would be re-circulated for Members' information.

the Secretariat

(Post-meeting note: CEDD's paper on "Ground Decontamination Works at the Site of Ex-Kennedy Town Incineration Plant/Abattoir and Adjoining Area" was re-circulated to Members on 22 December 2015. To address Members' subsequent comments, CEDD provided further information on the contamination level of Cadogan Street Temporary Garden and the information was circulated to Members on 13 January 2016 and 23 February 2016 respectively. The matter was discussed at the Hong Kong Task Force meeting on 29 February 2016.)

3.4 **Prof Becky LOO** opined that it would be beneficial for the Commission to be briefed on the overall tree management issue as a whole.

3.5 **The Chair** agreed that the issue would concern various harbourfront areas and should be discussed at the Commission in due course. **the Secretariat**

Item 4 Progress Report from Task Force on Kai Tak Harbourfront Development (Paper No. HC/18/2015)

4.1 **Mr Vincent NG**, the Chair of the Task Force, presented the progress report.

4.2 Regarding the last bullet under “Multi-purpose Sports Complex at Kai Tak (MPSC): Proposed Master Layout Plan and Findings of Planning Study” in the progress report, **the Chair** opined that it might not be appropriate to suggest categorically that Members did not object to the proposed increase in the building height or the proposed hotel development. He commented that a more general remark would better capture the understanding reached at the meeting.

4.3 **Mr Vincent NG** said that as far as he recalled, Members acknowledged that the detailed design for the sports complex was not available at the current stage and the design and interface issues with the surrounding environment would need to be further examined. Members were also worried that the sports complex might become a “phantom city” when there were no major sports events or events. In general, Members did not have objections towards the proposed relaxation of building height and hotel development, but without having a detailed design, Members were worried that submission of a planning application at the moment would be premature and possibly futile.

4.4 **Dr Peter Cookson SMITH** said that it had been 15 years already since the proposal of the MPSC was first drawn up in 2000. He opined that the MPSC occupied colossal space in Kai Tak but there was a lack of coordination in terms of urban design and planning for the area. More should be done in this regard.

4.5 On the concluding remark presented at the progress report, **Mr Vincent NG** said that to avoid readers for extracting only the first sentence and omitting the caveat made at the second sentence, he proposed to combing the two parts to read as follows -

“The Task Force concluded that despite they did not object to the proposed increase in the building height or the proposed hotel development, however, without a detailed design or further technical assessment, Members opined that it was premature to submit any planning application to the TPB at this stage.”

4.6 To make the conclusion less specific, **Miss Christine AU** further suggested to replace “the” with “a” as follows-

“The Task Force concluded that despite they did not object to “a” proposed increase in the building height or proposed hotel development”

4.7 **The Chair** thanked Mr Vincent NG and Miss Christine AU for their suggested amendments.

(Post-meeting note: Paper No. HC/18/2015 on “Progress Report from Task Force on Kai Tak Harbourfront Development” was revised in accordance with the suggested amendments. The revised paper was issued to Members on 22 December 2015.)

Item 5 Progress Report from Task Force on Harbourfront Developments in Kowloon, Tsuen Wan and Kwai

Tsing (Paper No. HC/19/2015)

5.1 **Prof Becky LOO**, the Chair of the Task Force, took Members through the progress report.

5.2 **The Chair** enquired whether LCSD would update Members on the progress of the Public Engagement (PE) exercise of the Tsim Sha Tsui Waterfront Revitalisation.

5.3 **Mrs Doris FOK** responded that the final report on Phase 1 PE was under preparation. Phase 2 PE would commence after the establishment of an Advisory Committee. The Task Force would be consulted before the commencement of Phase 2 PE.

5.4 **Prof Becky LOO** said that Members were updated on the progress and views received during Phase 1 PE at the last Task Force meeting. They were more concerned about the coverage and materials of Phase 2 PE. She enquired the tentative time table of Phase 2 PE.

5.5 **Mrs Doris FOK** responded that the Advisory Committee to lead Phase 2 PE had yet to be formed. LCSD would report to the Task Force on the latest progress when available.

LCSD

5.6 **Mr Ivan HO** said that he was invited to attend a public forum organised by Radio Television Hong Kong on 8 December 2015 in which participants were invited to express their views on the followings-

- (a) whether there was a need to revitalise the Tsim Sha Tsui waterfront;
- (b) whether management of public space by a private proponent was acceptable; and
- (c) whether the revitalisation plan could improve

utilization of public space.

Over 95% of the participants disagreed with all three questions above. He had committed to convey the views to the Commission. He opined that Phase 1 PE was not effective as the majority of the public either did not understand the need of revitalising the Tsim Sha Tsui waterfront or disagreed with the proposal. He suggested the project proponent to actively engaging the community.

5.7 **The Chair** asked LCSD to consider the public views conveyed by Mr Ivan HO when finalising the report of Phase 1 PE.

5.8 **Mrs Doris FOK** responded that comments from members of the public, including those expressed at the forum attended by Mr Ivan HO, would be incorporated into the final report of Phase 1 PE.

(Post-meeting note: The matter was discussed at the Kowloon Task Force meeting on 9 March 2016.)

Item 6 Progress Report from Task Force on Water-land Interface (Paper No. HC/20/2015)

6.1 **Mr LEUNG Kong-yui**, the Chair of the Task Force, presented the progress report.

6.2 There being no question from Members, **the Chair** thanked Mr LEUNG Kong-yui for the progress report.

Item 7 Any Other Business

A. Terms of Reference of the Harbourfront Commission

7.1 **The Chair** informed the meeting that Mr Paul

ZIMMERMAN had proposed amendments to the Terms of Reference (ToRs) of the Harbourfront Commission on 30 September 2015. He commented that it would be more appropriate to keep the specificity in the Task Forces' ToRs while having ToRs of the Commission to be broad and all embracing in nature. He recommended not making changes to the ToRs of the Commission and said that Chairs of the other three Task Forces shared with his view.

7.2 **The Chair** invited the Secretariat to circulate Mr Paul Zimmerman's proposed amendments and his recommendation to Members for comments.

the Secretariat

(Post-meeting note: Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN's proposed amendments to the ToRs of the Harbourfront Commission were circulated to Members on 23 December 2015 and Members' views were sought on the Chair's recommendation made in paragraph 8.1. No Member expressed objection to the Chair's recommendation.)

7.3 There being no other business, the meeting ended at 5:20 pm.

**Secretariat
Harbourfront Commission
April 2016**