

Harbourfront Commission
Task Force on Harbourfront Developments
in Kowloon, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing

Minutes of Thirty-seventh Meeting

Date : 9 June 2020
Time : 10:30 a.m.
Venue : Conference Room, 15/F, North Point Government Offices,
333 Java Road, Hong Kong

Present (in person)

Prof Becky LOO	Chair
Mr Andy LEWIS	Representing Business Environment Council
Sr Francis LAM	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors
Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN	Representing Society for Protection of the Harbour
Dr CHUNG Shan-shan	Representing The Conservancy Association
Ir Janice LAI	Individual Member
Mr NGAN Man-yu	Individual Member
Mr Steve CHEUNG	Co-opted Member (Kwai Tsing District Council (DC))
Mr Leo CHU	Co-opted Member (Yau Tsim Mong DC)
Mr TSANG Wing-hang	Co-opted Member (Individual)

Present (online)

Mr Freddie HAI	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Architects
Ms Iris HOI	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Landscape Architects
Ms Sam LOK	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Planners
Mr TAM Po-yiu	Representing Hong Kong Institute of Urban Design
Ir Victor CHEUNG	Representing Hong Kong Institution of Engineers
Ms Christina LEE	Individual Member
Hon Tony TSE	Individual Member
Ms Zoe CHOW	Co-opted Member (Sham Shui Po DC)
Dr Edmund LEE	Co-opted Member (Individual)
Mr Francis NGAI	Co-opted Member (Individual)
Mr Angus YICK	Co-opted Member (Tsuen Wan DC)

Official Members (attending in person)

Ms Doris HO	Deputy Secretary for Development (Planning & Lands) 1, Development Bureau (DEVB)
Mr Raymond LEE	Chief Engineer/South 1, Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD)
Mr Henry LAI	Secretary

Official Members (attending online)

Ms Anny TANG	Senior Manager (Tourism) 21, Tourism Commission (TC)
--------------	--

Mr Calvin YEUNG	Senior Engineer/Kowloon District Central, Transport Department (TD)
Mrs Doris FOK	Assistant Director (Leisure Services)1, Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD)
Mr Derek CHEUNG	District Planning Officer/Tsuen Wan & West Kowloon, Planning Department (PlanD)

In Attendance

Miss Rosalind CHEUNG	Principal Assistant Secretary (Harbour), DEVB
Mr Gavin YEUNG	Assistant Secretary (Harbour) 2, DEVB
Mr William CHAN	Project Manager (Harbour), DEVB
Mr Carlos FUNG	Senior Engineer (Harbour), DEVB
Ms Daphne LI	Architect (Harbour) 1, DEVB
Mr NG Shing-kit	Engineer (Harbour), DEVB

Absent with Apologies

Dr Vivian WONG	Representing Friends of the Earth (HK) Charity Limited
Mr Terence LEE	Representing Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong

For Agenda Item 3

Ms FUNG Miu-ling	Chief Leisure Manager (Hong Kong West), LCSD
Mr CHAN Tsz-fung	Chief Executive Officer (Planning) 1 (Ag.), LCSD
Ms Sabrina SUEN	Senior Executive Officer (Planning) 13, LCSD
Mr Gary WONG	Senior Project Manager 325, ArchSD
Mr Agnon FUNG	Project Manager 348, ArchSD
Mr Raphael YING	Director, Design 2 (HK) Ltd
Mr William LAI	Senior Architect, Design 2 (HK) Ltd
Ms Alison LEE	Director, ADI Ltd

For Agenda Item 4

Mr YC NG	General Manager, Engineering Services, West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA)
Mr Julian WONG	Urban Designer, WKCDA

Welcoming Message

The Chair welcomed all to the meeting, in particular Mr Steve CHEUNG, Mr Leo CHU, Mr Angus YICK and Ms Zoe CHOW who attended the Task Force meeting for the first time.

Mr Henry LAI informed the meeting that (a) Ms Anny TANG, Senior Manager of the Tourism Commission (TC), was attending the meeting on behalf of Mr Anson LAI, Assistant Commissioner for Tourism 2; and (b) Mr Calvin YEUNG, Senior Engineer of the Transport Department (TD), was attending on behalf of Mr David NGU, Chief Traffic Engineer/Kowloon.

Item 1 Confirmation of Minutes of the 36th Meeting

- 1.1 **The Chair** informed Members that the draft minutes of the 36th meeting were circulated on 5 June 2020. The revised draft minutes with Members' comments incorporated were circulated again on 8 June 2020. There being no further amendment, the draft minutes were confirmed at the meeting.

Item 2 Matters Arising

- 2.1 No matters arising were raised at the meeting.

Item 3 Open Space at Hoi Fan Road, Tai Kok Tsui (Paper No. TFK/01/2020)

Introduction

- 3.1 **The Chair** welcomed representatives from the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD), Architectural Services Department (ArchSD), Design 2 (HK) Ltd and ADI Ltd to the meeting.

Presentation by the LCSD and ArchSD

- 3.2 Upon **the Chair's** invitation, **Mr CHAN Tsz-fung** briefed Members on the background of the project as follows:
 - (a) it aimed to enhance pedestrian connectivity from the hinterland to the harbourfront and address local needs,

(b) it was part of the “Five-Year Plan for Sports and Recreation Facilities” introduced in the Policy Address in January 2017, and;

(c) the proposal had been discussed and supported by Yau Tsim Mong District Council (YTMDC).

3.3 With the aid of a PowerPoint, **Mr William LAI** presented to Members on the design of the project.

Discussion

Physical and Visual Permeability

3.4 **Mr Andy LEWIS** stressed the importance of visual permeability to the Tai Kok Tsui Promenade provided by the Open Space along with the existing visual corridor between Hampton Place and the Long Beach. **Sr Francis LAM** echoed his view. **Mr Freddie HAI** asked if the option of swapping the location of entrance of the pet garden and the main entrance had been considered to establish a better visual linkage from the hinterland. **Mr William LAI** responded that both entrances were clearly visible on Hoi Fan Road and the proposed design provided a more direct passage through the park.

3.5 **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** opined that connectivity between the hinterland side of the West Kowloon Highway and the site should be improved as the site was only served by one connecting footbridge across the Highway. **Hon Tony TSE** and **Dr Edmund LEE** echoed his view. In response, **Mr CHAN Tsz-fung** said that there was another footbridge near the neighbouring residential blocks, The Long Beach, which allowed access to the site. **Mr Calvin YEUNG** supplemented that existing footbridges and traffic lights were adequate and the TD was prepared to liaise with relevant parties if further enhancement was needed.

3.6 **Dr Edmund LEE** opined that signages from Nam Cheong Park to the promenade should be included holistically for better wayfinding. **The Chair**, **Sr Francis LAM** and **Ms Zoe CHOW** agreed. **The Chair** further remarked that coordination between LCSD and TD was crucial to ensure the provision of necessary connectivity between the hinterland and the harbourfront. **Sr Francis LAM** further proposed to provide wayfinding to access from Sham Shui Po station. In response, **Mr William LAI** agreed to consider installing a comprehensive wayfinding system in the site.

- 3.7 **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** enquired if access could be allowed around the building outside the northeast boundary of the site. **Mr Gary Wong** responded that the building was a distribution substation owned by the Mass Transit Railway (MTR) Corporation and an emergency vehicular access was on its east. Such proposal would be difficult to arrange. **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** suggested undertaking further negotiations with relevant parties.
- 3.8 **Mr Angus YICK** considered that the proposed open space could in the long run serve as a connection for people to walk from Sham Shui Po to West Kowloon Cultural District. **Sr Francis LAM** and **Ms Zoe CHOW** welcomed the proposal. **Ms CHOW** supplemented that the open space could also connect the new residential area at the harbourfront of Cheung Sha Wan with Tai Kok Tsui.

Inclusivity

- 3.9 **Mr TSANG Wing-hang** was concerned about barrier-free facilities along the way to the park and inside the park. **Dr Edmund LEE** and **Sr Francis LAM** shared the importance of inclusive design for all. **Mr Steve CHEUNG** opined that inclusive play equipment should be provided, while **Mr TAM Po-yiu** suggested examining the local demographics and including facilities that could accommodate the needs of users of different ages. **Mr Francis NGAI** shared the same views. **Ir Janice LAI** proposed to enlarge the children's play area by merging it with the fitness station. In response, **Mr CHAN Tsz-fung** clarified that inclusivity and provision of barrier-free facilities had been considered in the project.

Community Garden

- 3.10 **Mr Steve CHEUNG** expressed concerns over the location of the community garden as it was close to and might be shaded by the major trunk roads. In response, **Mr William LAI** explained that the community garden would be segregated from the major trunk roads by the MTR substation. The location was chosen having considered the need of providing adequate sunlight. It would also enable necessary vehicular access to the garden.

Sports Facilities

- 3.11 **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** asked if it was necessary to provide the proposed sports facilities, i.e. a footpath pitch and a basketball court, as similar facilities were already available in the vicinity.

He suggested exploring alternative facilities such as, e.g. roller rinks and scooter tracks. **Mr Angus YICK, Sr Francis LAM and Ir Janice LAI** shared the vision of introducing more diverse uses to the harbourfront areas, while **Hon Tony TSE and Dr Edmund LEE** emphasised that the facilities to be provided should cater for the wellbeing, aspirations and needs of the locals. **Ms Sam LOK** suggested exploring the potential use of sports facilities as venues for shows and community activities. **Mr CHAN Tsz-fung** responded that the project site fell within Yau Tsim Mong District and therefore Yau Tsim Mong District Council has been consulted on what facilities should best meet local needs at this site. **Mr Leo CHU** supplemented that the Yau Tsim Mong District Council had categorically expressed its wish to retain the football pitch in the design. **Mr William LAI** responded that the design of adjacent basketball courts offered flexibility as a multi-purpose area.

- 3.12 **Mr Francis NGAI** suggested providing bottle-refilling facilities and lockers for users of the sports facilities. **Mr Leo CHU** agreed and further suggested using organic materials for the artificial turf of the football pitch. He added that the spectator stand should be covered.
- 3.13 **Mr Leo CHU** considered that cycling should be permitted all the way to the West Kowloon Cultural District. **Mr CHAN Tsz-fung** responded that the present plan was not to allow cycling in the subject Open Space, but LCSD would coordinate with other departments should there be any change in the overall policy.

Amenities

- 3.14 **Mr Francis NGAI and Mr Angus YICK** were concerned about parking facilities in particular for users of the pet garden. **Hon Tony TSE** asked if the underground space could be used as carpark. **Mr Gary WONG** explained that much of the underground space of the site was designated as a drainage reserve which limited the development of underground facilities. **Mr CHAN Tsz-fung** added that neighbouring shopping mall offered parking space, and expected that most users would be from the local neighbourhoods and go to the open space on foot.
- 3.15 **Sr Francis LAM and Mr Freddie HAI** considered that adequate toilet facilities and a food and beverage kiosk should be provided respectively.

Landscaping and Greening

- 3.16 **Mr Andy LEWIS** suggested using undulating and soft landscaping to make the design even more attractive. **The Chair**

echoed his view.

- 3.17 **Mr TAM Po-yiu** suggested exploring the provision of rooftop garden at building structures.
- 3.18 **Dr Edmund LEE** suggested inviting participation by artists and designers, such as by way of a design competition or via project curation.

Environmental Friendliness and Lighting Design

- 3.19 In response to **Mr TAM Po-yiu's** enquiry about lighting design, **Mr William LAI** said that most lighting would be positioned at the ground level and projected downwards to mitigate light pollution.
- 3.20 **Dr CHUNG Shan-shan** remarked on energy and resource efficiency during construction while **Mr Angus YICK** asked about the adoption of passive lighting or solar panels in the design. **Mr Gary WONG** replied that eco-friendly device, e.g. photovoltaic panels and energy-efficient LED lights, would be used.

Future management

- 3.21 **Mr Angus YICK** was concerned about the division of work amongst departments in maintaining order and mitigating possible disturbances, e.g. noise pollution. **Mr Leo CHU** shared the same view. **Ms FUNG Miu-ling** replied that patrols would be strengthened.
- 3.22 **Ms Zoe CHOW** highlighted the issue of homelessness in Nam Cheong Park and opined that sufficient use of the park was crucial to prevent similar outcome.

Way forward

- 3.23 **The Chair** concluded by asking the project team to refine the design with due regard to Members' comments. She highlighted that accessibility and connectivity were the major concerns of the Task Force and the project team should communicate and collaborate with the MTR Corporation and the TD in this regard. She further remarked that the project shall proceed given the consultation and design efforts and the Task Force envisioned its implementation in the near future.

Item 4 Progress Update on the West Kowloon Cultural District (Paper No. TFK/02/2020)

Introduction

- 4.1 **The Chair** welcomed representatives from the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA) to the meeting.
- 4.2 **Mr Freddie HAI** declared interest given his involvement in the architectural design of the Hong Kong Palace Museum. **The Chair** decided that he could remain in the meeting and comment on matters other than the Hong Kong Palace Museum project.

A. Progress Update on the West Kowloon Cultural District

Presentation by the WKCDA

- 4.3 Upon **the Chair's** invitation, **Mr YC NG** briefed Members on the progress on the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) development.

Discussion

Connectivity with areas outside the WKCD

- 4.4 Regarding the proposed new exit road (NER), **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** commented that further details as to connections to other areas should be provided. **Mr Leo CHU** also asked whether the NER would be accessible by pedestrians and cyclists and whether it would be connected to the Sorrento Towers.
- 4.5 **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** observed that most people walked on the roads near the roundabout connecting Austin Road West, Nga Cheung Road and Museum Drive at present, instead of using the footbridge. He opined that walkability in that area shall be improved. **Mr YC NG** responded that the WKCDA was negotiating with the TD on the possibility of providing an at-grade pedestrian crossing there.
- 4.6 **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** asked about the details of connection of the Austin Road Pedestrian Linkage System with the existing pedestrian subway of Canton Road and its visual impact. **Mr YC NG** responded that the ArchSD was in charge of the beautification works and there had been much progress, e.g. the old roof of the tunnels near Xiqu Centre had been replaced by a noise mitigation deck.

- 4.7 **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** enquired about implementation of the pedestrian network to Kowloon Park and was concerned that the relocation of Tsim Sha Tsui Fire Station could not be materialised and the planned access could not be provided there. **Mr YC NG** responded that the Finance Committee of the Legislative Council approved in March 2020 to reprovision the workshop and safety equipment warehouse to a site in To Wah Road, allowing the implementation of the planned entrance on Canton Road to the WKCD. He added that WKCDA would engage a consultant to investigate possible connections to Kowloon Park and a plausible footbridge linking the China Ferry Terminal and the promenade. The study would commence in end 2020. **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** remarked that creative solutions could be explored to deal with the remaining facilities of the fire station.
- 4.8 **Mr TSANG Wing-hang** asked about the provision of ferry service to the WKCD. **Mr Freddie HAI** proposed that a permanent pier structure, instead of a floating pontoon, should be provided south of the M+ Museum. He opined that the community had clearly indicated its preference to travel from Hong Kong Island by ferry in previous public consultations, and such should provide sufficient justifications under the Protection of Harbour Ordinance to a permanent pier structure. **The Chair** acknowledged that the landing facilities were a breakthrough in facilitating water transportation in the area. In response, **Mr YC NG** said that the tender of the “water-taxi” ferry service calling at WKCD, Central, Tsim Sha Tsui, Hung Hom and Kai Tak had been awarded and would commence operation in 2020 Q4. Ferries would be temporarily parked at the Yau Ma Tei Typhoon Shelter while the development of long-term landing facilities in WKCD was in progress.
- 4.9 **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** opined that more emphasis on pedestrian than vehicular access was needed, especially for visitors from Tai Kok Tsui and Olympic City in the north. **Dr Edmund LEE** agreed. **The Chair** recognised both the importance of vehicular and pedestrian accesses and the Harbour Office would present on pedestrian connectivity between Tai Kok Tsui and WKCD later in the meeting. **Mr YC NG** added that roads under the proposed flyover lead to the Yau Ma Tei Public Cargo Working Area (PCWA) but further connections were to be developed by other departments as such matter fell outside the discretion of WKCDA.
- 4.10 In response to **Mr TSANG Wing-hang’s** enquiry about the provision of parking space, **Mr YC NG** clarified that there were currently around 300 units of parking space near the Art Park (Zone E), Project Site Office and Xiqu Centre.

Accessibility and Connectivity within the WKCD

- 4.11 **Mr TSANG Wing-hang** asked about the means of transport within the WKCD and suggested possible options such as automated people movers and personal transporters. **The Chair** and **Dr Edmund LEE** shared his view. **Dr Edmund LEE** also expressed concerns over excessive regulation of personal transporters in the area. Alternative clean mobility modes of transport should be facilitated.
- 4.12 In response, **Mr YC NG** said that an Autonomous Vehicle Service had been on trial to help with navigation within the WKCD and further studies would be conducted for the use of personal transporters. He added that the current design provided for a fully pedestrianised ground level and underground roads from Xiqu Center to M+ Museum, with lay-bys linking the underground roads with topside developments to ensure connectivity between zones.

Other Comments

- 4.13 Other than updating the progress of constructions, **Mr Francis NGAI** suggested having a recap on the visions of the WKCDA, exploring its relationship with other districts and the harbourfront, and studying existing community uses in the area to offer insights on future designs.
- 4.14 **Dr Edmund LEE** opined that strategies to establish an iconic image of the WKCD needed further explorations for it to be turned into a beloved destination for local citizens and visitors
- 4.15 In response to **the Chair's** proposal to arrange another site visit to the WKCD to facilitate further discussion, **Mr YC NG** suggested scheduling it in end of 2020 or early 2021 and the public relations team of WKCDA could assist in the arrangement.

B. Pedestrian connection between Tai Kok Tsui and the WKCD

Briefing by the Harbour Office

- 4.16 **Miss Rosalind CHEUNG** briefed Members on the background of the proposal of establishing a pedestrian connection between Tai Kok Tsui and the WKCD, along a narrow strip of land between the New Yau Ma Tei Public Cargo Working Area (PCWA) and Hoi Po Road as follows:

- (a) many stakeholders, including various departments and PWCA operators, were involved;
- (b) Harbour Office undertook active coordination in early 2020 and would like to seize the opportunity for change as the PCWA operation would be re-tendered in 2021; and
- (c) since it was a PCWA in active use, the main objective was to enhance connectivity and a lower standard than that of a regular passage might be applied.

4.17 With the aid of a PowerPoint, **Mr Carlos FUNG** presented on the findings and preliminary proposal of the project.

Discussion

4.18 **Mr Leo CHU** opined that the proposal could be discussed in the YTMDC when ready.

4.19 **Mr Andy LEWIS** added that the hinterland connection through the West Kowloon Station and the landscaped deck above Central Kowloon Route would nicely complement the proposed connection along the cargo area. On the other hand, **Mr LEWIS** agreed that a pedestrian footpath of 2-3m wide would have minimal impact on the cargo handling operation and urged to undertake timely negotiations and designs before re-tendering. **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** agreed and commented that as the proposed pedestrian connection was a pathway behind the PCWA rather than a promenade, and its realisation involved coordination among the Marine Department, the Transport Department and the Highways Department, the Transport and Housing Bureau should be better placed to take charge of the project.

Way forward

4.20 **The Chair** thanked the Harbour Office for the brief report. While acknowledging the constraints owing to the presence of the PCWA, Members saw the need to link up WKCD with Tai Kok Tsui even if the connection had to be located on the landward side. She suggested Harbour Office arranging a separate discussion on the proposal at a future meeting.

Item 5 Any Other Business

A. Harbourfront Enhancement at the Tsuen Wan Waterfront

- 5.1 With the aid of a PowerPoint, **Ms Daphne LI** briefed Members on the latest progress of the Enhancement of Tsuen Wan Waterfront and suggested that a site visit for Members could be organised in end 2020.
- 5.2 **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** commented that shading analysis on the sheltered seating shall be conducted.

B. Commercial development above West Kowloon High Speed Rail Station

- 5.3 **The Chair** informed Members that the Harbour Office would like to arrange an informal briefing on the master layout plan of the commercial development above West Kowloon High Speed Rail Station by Masterplan Ltd., the consultant of the developer.

[Post-meeting note: Having further liaised with the consultant, the item was arranged to be discussed at the 38th Meeting.]

C. Promenades at Cheung Sha Wan waterfront and Yau Tong Bay

- 5.4 **Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN** opined that the design of the North Point Promenade recently completed by private developer was not fully in line with the expectation of the Harbourfront Commission. He considered that interventions should be taken to avoid similar outcome in projects alike, e.g. developments in Yau Tong Bay and Cheung Sha Wan. **The Chair** asked the Harbour Office to investigate the issue.

[Post-meeting note: The Harbour Office (HO) has liaised with LCSD accordingly. HO will monitor the cases concerned closely to ensure that the promenades in Yau Tong Bay and Cheung Sha Wan would be implemented in accordance with the design presented to and taking into account comments of the Task Force. LCSD had also been reminded and undertaken to take on a stronger gate keeping role and in case major changes are proposed to the design, the Task Force would be further consulted.]

D. Date of next meeting

- 5.5 **The Chair** said that the Secretariat would inform Members of the date of the next meeting in due course.
- 5.6 There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 1:00pm.

**Secretariat
Task Force on Harbourfront Developments
in Kowloon, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing
Harbourfront Commission
September 2020**